

# UNITED STATES PATENT AND TRADEMARK OFFICE

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE
United States Patent and Trademark Office
Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS
P.O. Box 1450
Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450
www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.	
09/893,958	06/29/2001	Xuelu Zou	024705-110	6091	
75	90 07/15/2003				
E. Joseph Ges		EXAMINER			
P.O. Box 1404	NE, SWECKER & MATI	BOLDEN, ELIZABETH A			
Alexandria, VA	22313-1404		ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER	

1755 DATE MAILED: 07/15/2003

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

, i				1			
		Application No.	Applicant(s)	Applicant(s)			
		09/893,958					
	Office Action Summary	Examiner	Art Unit				
		Elizabeth A. Bolden	1755				
		pears on the cover sheet	with the correspondence ac	idress			
A SHOTHE I  - Exter after - If the - If NO - Failu - Any r	ORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION. Insions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.13 SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication. Period for reply specified above is less than thirty (30) days, a reply repriod for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period or the to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute eply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing	36(a). In no event, however, may y within the statutory minimum of will apply and will expire SIX (6) N , cause the application to become	r a reply be timely filed thirty (30) days will be considered time IONTHS from the mailing date of this of ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133).				
1)⊠	Responsive to communication(s) filed on 21 A	A <i>pril 2003</i> .					
2a)⊠	This action is <b>FINAL</b> . 2b) ☐ Th	is action is non-final.					
3) 🗌	closed in accordance with the practice under			ne merits is			
·		/are pending in the ann	lication				
•							
		are with a contract of the					
·		nd 108-110 is/are rejecte	ed.				
·		. <u> 700 770</u> 1070 10 10 10 10					
<u> </u>	, ,	r election requirement.					
•	• • •	•					
9)[	The specification is objected to by the Examine	r.					
10) 🔲 -	The drawing(s) filed on is/are: a)☐ accep	oted or b) objected to b	y the Examiner.				
11) 🔲 -		- ,— ,,	disapproved by the Examir	ier.			
		•					
,		aminer.					
•		n priority under 35 U.S.C	C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).				
a)[	···						
	<u> </u>						
	<u> </u>		· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	. =.			
* S	application from the International Bu	reau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)	)).	Stage			
14) 🗌 A	cknowledgment is made of a claim for domesti	c priority under 35 U.S.	C. § 119(e) (to a provisiona	ıl application).			
Attachmen	t(s)						
2) Notic	Elizabeth A. Bolden   1755						

U.S. Patent and Trademark Office PTO-326 (Rev. 04-01)

ċ.

Application/Control Number: 09/893,958

Art Unit: 1755

#### **DETAILED ACTION**

Any rejections and or objections, made in the previous Office Action, and not repeated below, are hereby withdrawn.

#### Claim Objections

Claim 110 is objected to because of the following informalities: typographical error.

In line 2 of claim 110 "ore" should be corrected to read "or".

Appropriate correction is required.

### Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:

(a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negatived by the manner in which the invention was made.

Claims 1-3, 11, 12, 17-19, 59-63, 65, 70-101, 105, 106, and 108-110 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Ishibashi et al., U.S. Patent 4,115,131.

Ishibashi et al. teach an optical glass in terms of weight percent. See column 1, lines 47-53, column 7, line 4 to column 8, line 16. Ishibashi et al. teach a glass having overlapping ranges of refractive index and Abbe number with instant claims 1-3 and 74-77. See abstract.

Ishibashi et al. differs from the instant claims by not teaching the glass composition in terms of mole percent.

Page 3

Application/Control Number: 09/893,958

Art Unit: 1755

It is believed that Ishibashi et al. teach a composition whose ranges if converted from wt% to mol % would overlap the compositional limitations of claims 11, 12, 17-19, 59-63, 65, 70-101, 105, 106, and 108-110 and theoretical composition below. See column 1, lines 47-53 and column 7, line 4 to column 8, line 16. Overlapping ranges have been held to establish *prima* facia obviousness. MPEP 2144.05

	B <sub>2</sub> O <sub>3</sub>	P <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub>	GeO <sub>2</sub>	Li <sub>2</sub> O	Na <sub>2</sub> O	K <sub>2</sub> O	SrO	BaO	ZnO	TiO <sub>2</sub>	Nb <sub>2</sub> O <sub>5</sub>	WO <sub>3</sub>
Wt %	4.0	20.0	1.0	4.0	7.0	2.0	2.0	6.0	5.0	5.0	28.0	16.0
Mol %	6.9	16.9	1.2	16.0	13.6	2.6	2.3	4.7	7.4	7.5	12.7	8.3

It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in the art at the time the invention was made to have selected from the overlapping portion of the ranges disclosed by the reference because overlapping ranges have been held to establish *prima facie* obviousness. See MPEP 2144.05.

One of ordinary skill in the art would expect that a glass with overlapping compositional ranges would have the properties recited in claims 1-3, 61-63, 70-73, and 78-81.

## Allowable Subject Matter

Claims 66-69 are objected to as being dependent upon a rejected base claim, but would be allowable if rewritten in independent form including all of the limitations of the base claim and any intervening claims.

The following is a statement of reasons for the indication of allowable subject matter:

The further limitation wherein the glass comprises no GeO<sub>2</sub> renders these claims allowable.

Application/Control Number: 09/893,958

Art Unit: 1755

## Response to Arguments

Applicant's arguments with respect to claims 1-3, 11, 12, 17-19, 59-63, 65, 70-101, 105, 106, and 108-110 have been considered but are moot in view of the new ground(s) of rejection.

#### Conclusion

Applicant's amendment necessitated the new ground(s) of rejection presented in this Office action. Accordingly, **THIS ACTION IS MADE FINAL**. See MPEP § 706.07(a). Applicant is reminded of the extension of time policy as set forth in 37 CFR 1.136(a).

A shortened statutory period for reply to this final action is set to expire THREE MONTHS from the mailing date of this action. In the event a first reply is filed within TWO MONTHS of the mailing date of this final action and the advisory action is not mailed until after the end of the THREE-MONTH shortened statutory period, then the shortened statutory period will expire on the date the advisory action is mailed, and any extension fee pursuant to 37 CFR 1.136(a) will be calculated from the mailing date of the advisory action. In no event, however, will the statutory period for reply expire later than SIX MONTHS from the date of this final action.

Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to Elizabeth A. Bolden whose telephone number is 703-305-0124. The examiner can normally be reached on 8:30am to 6:00 pm with alternating Fridays off.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Mark L. Bell can be reached on 703-308-3823. The fax phone numbers for the

Application/Control Number: 09/893,958

Art Unit: 1755

organization where this application or proceeding is assigned are 703-872-9310 for regular communications and 703-872-9311 for After Final communications.

Any inquiry of a general nature or relating to the status of this application or proceeding should be directed to the receptionist whose telephone number is 703-308-0661.

**EAB** 

July 9, 2003

DAVID SAMPLE

Page 5

PRIMARY EXAMINER